

Tax and the Digital Economy

Challenges and Proposals for Reform

Edited by

Werner Haslehner
Georg Kofler
Katerina Pantazatou
Alexander Rust



Table of Contents

| | |
|--|-------|
| Editors | v |
| Contributors | vii |
| Preface and Acknowledgements | xxiii |
| CHAPTER 1 | |
| The 2018 OECD Interim Report | |
| <i>Eric Robert</i> | 1 |
| §1.01 Introduction | 1 |
| §1.02 The OECD/G20 BEPS Project and the 2015 OECD BEPS Action 1 Report | 2 |
| §1.03 Renewed G20 Interest and the 2018 OECD Interim Report | 4 |
| [A] Value Creation and Business Models | 4 |
| [B] Positive Impacts of BEPS Implementation | 5 |
| [C] Towards a Global Consensus-Based Reform of the International Income Tax System | 6 |
| [D] Interim Measures | 7 |
| [E] Beyond International Income Tax Rules | 8 |
| §1.04 The Road Ahead | 8 |
| CHAPTER 2 | |
| The ‘Genuine Link’ Requirement for Source Taxation in Public International Law | |
| <i>Juliane Kokott</i> | 9 |
| §2.01 Introduction | 9 |
| §2.02 Definitions | 10 |
| [A] The Genuine Link under Public International Law | 10 |
| [1] The <i>Lotus Case</i> and the Principle of Territoriality | 10 |

Table of Contents

| | | | |
|--|-----|---|----|
| | [2] | The <i>Nottebohm Case</i> and the ‘Genuine’ Link | 12 |
| | [3] | The Reasonable Exercise of Jurisdiction | 13 |
| | [B] | Links/Nexus in Tax Law | 15 |
| | [1] | Residence Taxation | 15 |
| | [2] | Source Taxation | 16 |
| §2.03 | | The Genuine Link Requirement for Source Taxation | 16 |
| | [A] | Lack of Adequate Rules | 16 |
| | [B] | Virtual Establishments, Place of Consumption, and the Destination Principle | 17 |
| | [1] | Redefining Territoriality | 17 |
| | [2] | A Broader Understanding of Nexus | 19 |
| §2.04 | | The Future: Apportionment or Move Towards Indirect Taxation? | 21 |
| | [A] | Apportionment | 21 |
| | [B] | Move Towards Indirect Taxation | 22 |
| §2.05 | | Conclusions | 23 |
| CHAPTER 3 | | | |
| EU and WTO Law Limits on Digital Business Taxation | | | |
| <i>Werner Haslehner</i> | | | |
| §3.01 | | Introduction | 25 |
| §3.02 | | Digital Business Taxation Reform: Background | 26 |
| | [A] | Tax Policy Challenges Arising from Digitalization | 26 |
| | [B] | Tax Policy Responses | 27 |
| §3.03 | | EU Law Limits | 29 |
| | [A] | Limits on EU Member States | 29 |
| | [1] | Member States Legislative Competence | 29 |
| | [2] | Internal Market Rules | 30 |
| | [3] | Secondary EU Law | 33 |
| | [B] | Limits on the EU Legislature | 36 |
| | [1] | EU Legislative Competence | 36 |
| | [2] | Internal Market Rules | 40 |
| | [3] | Public International Law | 41 |
| §3.04 | | WTO Law Limits | 43 |
| | [A] | The WTO Legal Framework: Application to Tax Law | 43 |
| | [B] | Potential Application to Digital Tax Proposals | 45 |
| §3.05 | | Conclusion | 47 |
| CHAPTER 4 | | | |
| Fairness of the Taxation of the Digital Economy | | | |
| <i>Gianluigi Bizioli</i> | | | |
| §4.01 | | Introduction | 49 |
| §4.02 | | The (Slippery) Meanings of Tax Fairness | 50 |

| | | | |
|---|-----|---|----|
| | [A] | Tax Fairness in the Economic and Legal Literature: A Review | 50 |
| | [1] | The Roots: The Principle of Tax Equality | 50 |
| | [2] | The Two Versions of the Benefit Principle | 52 |
| | [3] | The Ability-to-Pay Principle | 55 |
| | [B] | The International Scenario | 57 |
| §4.03 | | Tax Fairness and the Proposals for the Taxation of the Digital Economy | 59 |
| | [A] | The Meaning of Tax Fairness Raised by the OECD and EU Documents on Digital Economy Taxation | 59 |
| §4.04 | | Do the Proposed Solutions Comply with Traditional Concepts of Tax Fairness? | 61 |
| | [A] | Introduction: A Brief Summary of the Proposed Solutions | 61 |
| §4.05 | | Are the Solutions and the Proposals for Digital Economy Taxation Fair? A Preliminary Conclusion | 63 |
| §4.06 | | Conclusions | 65 |
| CHAPTER 5 | | | |
| Tax Policy for the Digitalized Economy under Benjamin Franklin's Rule for Decision-Making | | | |
| | | <i>Andrés Báez Moreno & Yariv Brauner</i> | 67 |
| §5.01 | | Introduction and Scope | 67 |
| §5.02 | | Describing the Proposed Tax Policy Options | 71 |
| | [A] | A New Tax 'Nexus' Concept: SEP | 72 |
| | [B] | A WHT on Certain Types of (Digital) Transactions | 74 |
| | [C] | A Digital Equalization Levy | 75 |
| §5.03 | | Our Proposal to Establish a Stand-Alone Gross-Basis Final WHT on (Cross-Border) Services in B2B Contexts | 76 |
| | [A] | A Stand-Alone Final WHT | 77 |
| | [B] | A WHT on (Cross-Border) B2B Services | 77 |
| | [1] | The Exclusion of Goods | 77 |
| | [2] | A Mere Reference to Services | 79 |
| | [3] | Cross-Border (or Also Domestic) Services | 79 |
| | [4] | Exclusion of B2C Services | 81 |
| §5.04 | | A WHT Solution Vis-à-Vis Other Policy Alternatives | 82 |
| | [A] | Design and Implementation Issues | 83 |
| | [1] | Definition and Control of Thresholds | 83 |
| | [2] | Profit Attribution | 85 |
| | [3] | Digital and Non-digital Transactions, B2B and B2C Transactions and Domestic and Cross-Border Transactions | 87 |
| | [a] | Digital and Non-digital Transactions | 87 |
| | [b] | B2B and B2C Transactions | 88 |
| | [c] | Domestic and Cross-Border Transactions | 89 |

Table of Contents

| | | | |
|--|-----|---|-----|
| | [d] | Method of Taxation (Net Versus Gross Taxation) | 90 |
| | [e] | Compliance and Enforcement | 92 |
| [B] | | Legal Consistency Issues | 93 |
| | [1] | Double Taxation Conventions (DTCs) | 93 |
| | [2] | WTO Law | 96 |
| | [3] | EU Law | 97 |
| §5.05 | | Conclusions | 98 |
| CHAPTER 6 | | | |
| Equalization Taxes and the EU's 'Digital Services Tax' | | | |
| <i>Georg Kofler & Julia Sinnig</i> | | | 101 |
| §6.01 | | Introduction and Background | 101 |
| | [A] | Tax Challenges of the Digital Economy | 101 |
| | [B] | Potential Approaches: OECD and EU | 106 |
| | [C] | EU Directive Proposals: SDP and DST | 110 |
| §6.02 | | The Idea of Equalization Taxes: Assessment and Criticism | 114 |
| | [A] | Equalization Taxes in OECD BEPS Action 1 | 114 |
| | [B] | Policy and Technical Challenges of Equalization Levies | 117 |
| | [1] | Broader Economic Risks and Challenges | 117 |
| | [2] | Necessary Design Features of Equalization Taxes | 119 |
| | [a] | Compliance with International Obligations (Tax Treaties, EU Law, and WTO Law) | 119 |
| | [b] | Temporary Nature of an Equalization Tax as an Interim Measure | 122 |
| | [c] | Targeted Scope of an Equalization Tax | 122 |
| | [d] | Minimizing Overtaxation | 123 |
| | [e] | Minimizing Impact on Start-Ups, Business Creation, and Small Businesses | 124 |
| | [f] | Minimizing Cost and Complexity | 125 |
| §6.03 | | The EU's DST | 126 |
| | [A] | Policy Objectives | 126 |
| | [B] | Legal Basis | 127 |
| | [C] | The DST's Characteristics | 128 |
| | [1] | Tax Rate, Taxable Persons, and the Tax Base | 128 |
| | [2] | Taxable Transactions and Place of Taxation | 129 |
| | [3] | Tax Collection and Enforcement | 132 |
| | [D] | DST Challenges and Practical Issues | 133 |
| | [1] | Incompatibility and Lack of Coordination with Existing Legal Frameworks | 134 |
| | [a] | Relationship with Double Tax Conventions: Double Taxation | 134 |

| | | |
|--|--|-----|
| | [b] Interference with EU Law | 136 |
| | [c] Interference with WTO Law | 137 |
| | [2] Selected Policy Objections | 137 |
| | [3] Broader Practical Issues | 140 |
| §6.04 | Summary and Conclusions | 143 |
| CHAPTER 7 | | |
| Digital Permanent Establishments on Its Way to Becoming a Reality? The EU Commission's Proposal on Taxing 'Significant Digital Presence' | | |
| | <i>Peter Bräumann</i> | 147 |
| §7.01 | Introduction | 147 |
| §7.02 | The Questionable Rationale Behind 'Digital PEs' | 152 |
| | [A] The Changed Stance Towards 'Physical Presence': Still Physical after All | 152 |
| | [B] Shifting Income Taxation to the Demand Side of Business Operations? | 154 |
| | [C] 'Value Creation' as Substantial Counterargument to Demand Orientation? | 156 |
| | [D] The True Background: Tax Policy and the Sentiment of Revenue Lost by 'Importers' of Digital Services | 160 |
| §7.03 | SDP: The 'Digital PE' as Concretely Proposed by the European Commission | 162 |
| | [A] Legal Framework | 162 |
| | [B] Territorial Scope | 165 |
| | [C] Material Scope: 'Digital Services Through Digital Interfaces' | 166 |
| | [D] Thresholds for Establishing a SDP | 171 |
| | [E] Profit Attribution to an Established SDP | 174 |
| §7.04 | Résumé | 176 |
| CHAPTER 8 | | |
| Tax Treatment of Digital Currencies | | |
| | <i>Michael Tumpel & Johannes Kofler</i> | 177 |
| §8.01 | What Are Digital Currencies? | 177 |
| §8.02 | The Blockchain Technology Behind Cryptocurrencies | 179 |
| §8.03 | Questions Related to the Tax Treatment of Digital Currencies | 183 |
| §8.04 | Digital Currencies as a Means of Payment | 184 |
| §8.05 | Private Investments in Digital Currencies | 185 |
| §8.06 | Verification of Transactions of Digital Currencies | 185 |
| §8.07 | Mining of Digital Currencies | 187 |
| §8.08 | Income Tax Questions | 187 |
| §8.09 | Conclusion | 188 |

Table of Contents

CHAPTER 9

Taxing Remote Digital Supplies

Marie Lamensch

| | | |
|-------|---|-----|
| | | 189 |
| §9.01 | ‘Digital Supplies’: A Conceptual Challenge for the VAT System | 189 |
| §9.02 | Electronically Supplied Services: EU VAT Directive Place of Supply and Related Collection Rules | 193 |
| [A] | B2B Electronically Supplied Services | 193 |
| [1] | Destination-Based Taxation and Reverse Charge | 193 |
| [2] | Customer Identification | 194 |
| [3] | Customer Location | 196 |
| [4] | Changes to Come with the Adoption of the E-Commerce Package? | 198 |
| [B] | B2C Electronically Supplied Services | 199 |
| [1] | Destination-Based Taxation and the MOSS System | 199 |
| [2] | Customer Location | 201 |
| [3] | A Deeming Provision for Platforms | 203 |
| [4] | Changes to Come with the Adoption of the E-Commerce Package? | 206 |
| [a] | An ‘E-Commerce Package for All B2C E-Commerce Transactions’ | 206 |
| [b] | Availability of the Non-union Scheme for Non-EU Suppliers with an EU VAT Number | 207 |
| [c] | A First Threshold of EUR 10,000 (as of 2019) | 207 |
| [d] | Home Country Rules for Invoicing and Record-Keeping | 208 |
| [e] | Relaxed Customer Identification Requirement below a Second Threshold of EUR 100,000 | 208 |
| [f] | Longer Deadlines to Submit MOSS Returns and Easier Procedure to Correct VAT Returns | 209 |
| [g] | Final Comments on the E-commerce Package | 209 |
| §9.03 | Electronically Supplied Services: EU VAT Directive Provisions on Reduced Rates and Recent EC Proposal | 209 |
| [A] | Current Rules | 209 |
| [B] | EC Proposal: Possibility to Apply Reduced Rates in the Future? | 212 |
| §9.04 | Conclusions and Final Comments | 213 |

CHAPTER 10

The Taxation of the Sharing Economy

Katerina Pantazatou

| | | |
|--------|---|-----|
| | | 215 |
| §10.01 | Introduction | 215 |
| §10.02 | What Is the Sharing Economy? | 216 |
| §10.03 | Taxing the Platform and the Service Providers: Recurring Issues | 218 |

| | | |
|---|--|-----|
| [A] | The Platform | 219 |
| [1] | VAT | 220 |
| [2] | Enforcement/Collection | 222 |
| [B] | The Service Provider | 224 |
| [1] | Legal Relationship | 226 |
| [2] | VAT | 227 |
| [3] | What Kind of Taxes? | 230 |
| [4] | Enforcement/Collection | 231 |
| [5] | Effective Lower Taxation? | 232 |
| §10.04 | The 2018 EU Proposals | 234 |
| §10.05 | Conclusion | 235 |
| CHAPTER 11 | | |
| Effective Taxation Versus Effective Data Protection? | | |
| | <i>Viktoria Wöhrer</i> | 237 |
| §11.01 | Introduction | 237 |
| §11.02 | Ensuring Effective Taxation: Increasing Data Collection | 240 |
| §11.03 | Taxpayers' Rights in the Area of Exchange of Information | 243 |
| §11.04 | Data Protection in the EU | 245 |
| §11.05 | Scope of EU Data Protection Safeguards | 246 |
| §11.06 | Requirements Stemming from EU Data Protection | 248 |
| [A] | Requirements under Article 8 ECHR | 248 |
| [B] | Requirements under Charter Article 8 and the GDPR | 249 |
| [1] | Lawfulness, Fairness and Transparency | 249 |
| [2] | Purpose Limitation | 250 |
| [3] | Data Minimization | 251 |
| [4] | Accuracy | 254 |
| [5] | Storage Limitation | 254 |
| [6] | Integrity and Confidentiality | 256 |
| §11.07 | Procedural Rights Stemming from EU Data Protection | 256 |
| [A] | Right to Be Informed about Exchange of Information | 256 |
| [B] | Right of Access to the Data | 259 |
| [C] | Right to Rectification and Erasure | 259 |
| §11.08 | Conclusion | 260 |
| CHAPTER 12 | | |
| Digitalization and the Future of National Tax Systems: Taxing Robots? | | |
| | <i>Joachim Englisch</i> | 261 |
| §12.01 | Introduction | 261 |
| §12.02 | Robots as Taxable Persons | 264 |
| [A] | Income Tax | 264 |
| [B] | Value Added Tax/Goods and Services Tax | 267 |
| §12.03 | Taxing the Use of Robots | 267 |

Table of Contents

| | | |
|--|---|-----|
| [A] | As a Fiscal Substitute for Wage and Payroll Taxes | 267 |
| [1] | ... Justified as a Tax on Imputed Income? | 268 |
| [2] | ... Justified as an Equalization Levy? | 269 |
| [3] | Restraints Imposed by International Tax Competition | 271 |
| [B] | As an Optimal Income Redistribution Instrument? | 273 |
| [C] | As a Pigouvian Tax | 274 |
| §12.04 | A Common Challenge: Defining the Scope of a ‘Robot Tax’ | 277 |
| §12.05 | Other Tax Implications of the Increasing Use of Intelligent Robots | 278 |
| §12.06 | Conclusions | 279 |
| CHAPTER 13 | | |
| Big Data in Tax Collection and Enforcement | | |
| | <i>Tina Ehrke-Rabel</i> | 283 |
| §13.01 | Introduction | 283 |
| §13.02 | Tax Collection and Enforcement | 286 |
| [A] | Information Asymmetry and Personal Autonomy | 286 |
| [B] | Traditional Tax Collection and Enforcement | 288 |
| [C] | Change of the Game: New Tools | 290 |
| [D] | Legal Constraints of Tax Collection and Enforcement | 294 |
| [1] | Rule of Law | 294 |
| [2] | Right to Respect for Private and Family Life and Correspondence | 295 |
| [3] | Right to Protection of Personal Data | 297 |
| [4] | Rights of the Defence | 298 |
| [E] | Conclusion | 299 |
| §13.03 | Big Data Analytics in Tax Matters | 300 |
| [A] | Definition of Big Data | 300 |
| [B] | Purpose, Use and Benefits of Big Data | 301 |
| [1] | Purpose | 301 |
| [2] | Use of Big Data | 302 |
| [3] | Benefits of Big Data | 303 |
| [C] | Big Data in Tax Matters: Really in Use? | 303 |
| §13.04 | Legal Concerns | 305 |
| [A] | Introduction | 305 |
| [B] | The OECD’s Vision of Big Data Benefits in Tax Matters | 305 |
| [C] | Position 1: Big Data Analytics Do Not Raise Any Legal Concerns | 307 |
| [D] | Position 2: Big Data Analytics Raise Legal Concerns | 309 |
| [1] | Concerns Related to the Technical Functioning of Big Data Algorithms | 309 |
| [a] | Preliminary Remarks | 309 |
| [b] | Technical Specificities of Big Data Algorithms | 309 |
| [c] | Prediction | 310 |
| [d] | Opacity | 311 |

| | | | |
|--------|-----|--|-----|
| | [e] | Algorithms Magnify Programmed Biases | 311 |
| | [2] | Input Data-Related Concerns | 312 |
| | [a] | Origin of the Data | 312 |
| | [b] | Accuracy of the Data | 312 |
| | [c] | Cross-Checking of Data | 313 |
| | [3] | Concerns Related to the Psychological Impact of Big Data Algorithms | 313 |
| | [4] | Conclusion | 314 |
| §13.05 | | Legal Actions To Take | 315 |
| | [A] | Introduction | 315 |
| | [B] | Rule of Law, Principle of Equality, Rights of the Defence | 315 |
| | [1] | Basic Requirements on Big Data Analytics | 315 |
| | [2] | Origin of the Data | 316 |
| | [3] | Accuracy of the Data | 316 |
| | [4] | Procedural Regularity | 318 |
| | [C] | Privacy | 319 |
| | [1] | Preliminary Remarks | 319 |
| | [2] | Taxpayer Monitoring | 320 |
| | [a] | Justifying Interferences with the Right to Privacy in General | 320 |
| | [b] | Legitimacy of Taxpayer Monitoring | 320 |
| | [c] | Secret Surveillance for Tax Purposes? | 322 |
| | [d] | Conclusion | 325 |
| | [3] | Taxpayer Profiling and GDPR | 325 |
| | [a] | Big Data Analytics as Taxpayer Profiling | 325 |
| | [b] | Rights and Obligations with Regard to Profiling | 325 |
| | [c] | Limitations | 326 |
| | [d] | Conclusion | 327 |
| | [D] | Conclusion | 328 |
| §13.06 | | Use and Purpose of Tax Big Data Analytics | 328 |
| | [A] | Data Storage | 328 |
| | [B] | Real-Time Monitoring Through IoT | 328 |
| | [C] | Audit Selection | 329 |
| | [D] | ‘Targeted Advertising’ of Taxpayers | 331 |
| | [1] | By Nudges | 331 |
| | [2] | By Legal Statutes | 332 |
| §13.07 | | Final Conclusions | 333 |
| Index | | | 335 |