Reforming the French Law of Obligations

Comparative Reflections on the Avant-projet de réforme du droit des obligations et de la prescription ('the Avant-projet Catala')

Edited by

JOHN CARTWRIGHT
STEFAN VOGENAUER
and
SIMON WHITTAKER

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON
2009
# Contents

- Preface: v
- Contributors: xv
- List of Abbreviations: xvii

## Part I  Introducing the *Avant-projet de réforme*

1. **The Avant-projet de réforme: An Overview**
   - STEFAN VOGENAUER: 3
     1. Background: 3
        - (a) Codification, Decodification and Recodification: 4
        - (b) European and Global Challenges: 7
     2. Genesis: 9
     3. Structure, Presentation and Style: 10
     4. Content: 11
     5. Reception: 15
     6. Conclusions: 20
     7. Bibliography: 22

## Part II  Assessing the *Avant-projet de réforme*

### A. Negotiation and Renegotiation

2. **Negotiation and Renegotiation: A French Perspective**
   - BÉNÉDICTE FAUVARQUE-COSSON: 33
     1. Negotiation: 34
        - (a) Good Faith During Negotiations: 35
        - (b) Sanctions: 38
     2. Renegotiation: 43
        - (a) Articles 1135 to 1135-1 of the *Avant-projet*: 43
        - (b) Comparative Perspective: 45
     3. Conclusion: 48

3. **Negotiation and Renegotiation: An English Perspective**
   - JOHN CARTWRIGHT: 51
     1. Negotiation: 51
Contents

(a) English Law: No General Duty between Negotiating Parties 52
(b) French Law: The Move Towards a Protected Relationship? 57
(c) Essential Differences in the Approach to the Negotiations 60

II. Renegotiation
(a) French Law: A Link between Negotiation and Renegotiation 62
(b) English Law: Breaking Down the Resistance to a Duty to (Re)Negotiate? 65
(c) Parallels and Differences 68

B. A Future for *la cause*?

4 A Future for *la cause*? Observations of a French Jurist
JUDITH ROCHFELD 73

I. The Renewal of the Definition: from Counterparty to Interest 75
(a) The ‘Concretisation’ of Cause: The Consideration of the Real Interest 77
(b) The ‘Subjectivisation’ of Cause: The Consideration of Individually Defined Aims 81

II. The Renewal of the Uses of Cause: from an Abstract Control of Balance to a Control of the Real Utility of the Contract 83
(a) The Imposition of a Minimum Inviolable Reasonable Interest, or Typical Cause 84
(b) The Control of the Reasonable Interest According to the ‘Desired Economic Outcome’ or Atypical Cause 87
(c) Cause, Proportionality and Coherence 90

III. The Renewal of the Sanction: from the Nullity of the Contract to the Eradication of Clauses Undermining Goals 93
(a) The Recognition of the Protection of Individual Interests: Relative Nullity 93
(b) The Defence of the Essence of Contract: The Invalidation of a Clause Undermining the Goal 94

IV. Conclusion 99

5 *La cause* or the Length of the French Judiciary’s Foot
RUTH SEFTON-GREEN 101

I. Fair Exchange and Making Good Choices 103
(a) Judicial Assessment of the Parties’ Substantive Bargain 103
(b) Judicial Elimination of Terms of the Contract that are Incompatible with the Contract’s Core 112

II. The Legitimacy of Judicial Intervention: Paternalism 117
C. Enforcement of Contractual Obligations

6 The Enforcement of Contractual Obligations: A French Perspective
YVES-MARIE LAITHIER

I. The Preference for the Voluntary Performance of Contractual Obligations
   (a) Performance of the Contract in Which the Debtor has an Interest
   (b) The Performance of a Contract Which has Lost its Point for the Debtor

II. The Preference for the Enforced Performance in Kind of Contractual Obligations
   (a) The Obstacles to Enforced Performance in Kind
   (b) Contractual Arrangements for Enforced Performance in Kind

7 The Enforcement of Contractual Obligations: Comparative Observations on the Notion of Performance
LUCINDA MILLER

I. Introduction
II. Exécution en nature and the Avant-projet
   (a) Proposed Article 1154; the Primacy of exécution en nature
   (b) Exécution en nature and (Non)-Performance
   (c) Protection of the 'Performance Interest'
III. Penalty Clauses and Performance
   (a) The clause pénale within the Code civil
   (b) Avant-projet Modifications
IV. Conclusion

D. Termination for Non-performance and its Consequences

8 Termination of Contract: A Missed Opportunity for Reform
MURIEL FABRE-MAGNAN

I. The Only Question Considered: Termination of Contract as a Remedy for Non-performance by One Party of his Obligations (Termination for Non-performance)
   (a) The Conditions for the Remedy
(b) The Effects of the Remedy

II. The Neglected Issue: Termination of Contract as a Right for Each Party to Extricate Himself from a Contract of Indefinite Duration (A Right to Unilateral Prospective Termination)

(a) Unilateral Prospective Termination of Contracts of Indefinite Duration

(b) The Adaptation of the General Law of Contract to the Diversity of Contractual Instances


SIMON WHITTAKER

I. 'La révolte du droit contre le code'

II. Réolution and the Avoidance of Logic

(a) The Survival of Some Contract Terms after réolution

(b) Contractual Liability in Damages and its Measure

III. Concluding Observations

E. The Effects of Contracts on Third Parties

10 Contracts and Third Parties in the Avant-projet de réforme

DENIS MAZEAUD

I. Reproducing the Current Law

(a) The Relative Effect of Concluded Contracts

(b) The Obligational Effect of Contracts in Progress

(c) The 'Opposability' of Contractual Non-performance

II. Reform of the Current Law

(a) The Attractive Effect of Contractual Non-performance

(b) The Principle of the Attractive Effect of Contractual Groups

11 The Effects of Contracts on Third Parties: The Avant-projet de réforme in a Comparative Perspective

STEFAN VOGENAUER

I. Reinforcing Relative Effect

II. Reinforcing Exceptions to Relative Effect

(a) Stipulations for the Benefit of a Third Party

(b) A Multitude of Further Exceptions

III. Reinforcing Relative Effect?
F. The Definition of la faute

12 The Definition of la faute in the Avant-projet de réforme
JEAN-SÉBASTIEN BORGHETTI 271

I. Assumed Faithfulness to the Existing Law 275
   (a) Endorsing the Objective Conception of Fault 275
   (b) Endorsing the Definition of Objective Fault Espoused by Academic Writers 277

II. Confirmation of a Development 283
   (a) Fault, an Increasingly Abstract and Disembodied Idea 284
   (b) Fault, Merely a Criterion for the Imputation of a Duty to Make Reparation? 286

13 The Role of la faute in the Avant-projet de réforme
PAULA GILIKER 289

I. Introduction 289
II. A Recategorisation of Contractual and Delictual Liability 291
III. General or Special Regimes of Liability: A Re-examination of faute in the Law of Delict 293
IV. Article 1362: Liability for les activités dangereuses—A Step Too Far? 299
V. Conclusion 302

G. Damages, Loss and the Quantification of Damages

14 Damages, Loss and the Quantification of Damages in the Avant-projet de réforme
PAULINE RÉMY-CORLAY 305

I. A Victimophile Law on Reparation 310
   (a) A Law on Reparation 310
   (b) The Right to Compensation: Personal Injury 315
II. A Law of Reparation Seeking the Fusion of Contract and Delict 318
   (a) The Distinctiveness of Contractual Liability? 318
   (b) Reparation in Kind as Contrasted with Performance in Kind 322
Comparative Observations on the Introduction of Punitive Damages in French Law

SOLENE ROWAN

I. Introduction

II. The Rationale Underlying Punitive Damages

III. The Circumstances Giving Rise to Punitive Damages

IV. The Justification for, and Itemisation of, Punitive Damages Awards

V. The Level of Punitive Damages

VI. To Whom may Punitive Damages be Awarded?

VII. Insurance

VIII. Is The Introduction of Punitive Damages in French Law Desirable?

IX. Conclusion

Reforming the French Law of Prescription

ROBERT WINTGEN

I. What Would Change

(a) With Regard to Periods

(b) The Causes of Interruption and Suspension

II. What Would Not Change

(a) The Retention of Certain Provisions Relating to the Causes of Suspension

(b) The Retention of the Unitary Approach to Acquisitive and Extinctive Prescription

JOHN CARTWRIGHT

I. Some Fundamental Questions (and Instincts?) about the Law of Prescription

(a) Legal Instincts? Striking a Balance

(b) Roman Law: Instincts and Policies

(c) English Law: Instincts and Policies

II. The Pressures for Reform in Modern French Law and English Law

(a) Problems in the Existing French Law

(b) Problems in the Existing English Law
III. The Proposals of the Avant-Projet—and some English Law Comparisons

(a) Overview: A ‘Limited Reform’? 370
(b) Limitation Periods 371
(c) The Starting-point for the Running of the Period 373
(d) Suspensions and Interruptions 375
(e) The Place of the Court and of the Parties 376

IV. Harmonisation of the Law of Prescription? 376

V. Postscript: The Proposals for the Reform of the Law of Prescription as an Illustration of Different Approaches to Law Reform 378

I. The Perspective of the Judiciary

18 The Work of the Cour de cassation on the Avant-projet de réforme
PIERRE SARGOS 383

I. The Reform of the Law of Obligations 388
II. The Reform of the Law of Civil Liability and the Law of Prescription 394
III. Conclusions 401

J. Summaries of the Discussions and Emerging Themes

19 Summaries of the Discussions
SIMON WHITTAKER, STEFAN VOGENAUER AND JOHN CARTWRIGHT 405

I. Discussions on the Law of Contract: Negotiation and Cause (Simon Whittaker) 405
II. Discussions on the Law of Contract: Enforcement, Termination and Effects on Third Parties (Stefan Vogenauer) 407
III. Discussions on the Law of Delict and Prescription (John Cartwright) 409
(a) Delict 409
(b) Prescription 411

20 Emerging Themes
HUGH BEALE, PHILIPPE THÉRY AND GERHARD DANNEMANN 413

I. Emerging Themes in the Law of Contract: Negotiations and Cause (Hugh Beale) 413
xiv  Contents

II. Emerging Themes in the Law of Contract: Enforcement, Termination and Effects on Third Parties (Philippe Théry) 416
III. Emerging Themes in the Law of Delict (Gerhard Dannemann) 419

Part III  Translating the Avant-projet de réforme

21  Translating the Avant-projet de réforme
SIMON WHITTAKER AND JOHN CARTWRIGHT 425
I. General Observations 426
II. The Translation of French Terms with Multiple Significance 429
   (a) 'de plein droit' 429
   (b) 'acte' and 'fait' 432
   (c) 'contrat' and 'convention' 435
III. Translating Difference: The Analytical Structure of Contractual Obligations and their Effects 437

APPENDIX: Avant-projet de réforme du droit des obligation et de la prescription (original French text by PIERRE CATALA and parallel English translation by JOHN CARTWRIGHT AND SIMON WHITTAKER) 445

Index 917