Human Rights and Minority Rights in the European Union

Kirsten Shoraka
Contents

Table of cases xi
Table of legislation xv
List of abbreviations xxxiii

1 Overview 1

1.1 Introduction 1

1.2 The framework for the protection of minority rights in international law 4

1.2.1 The concept of non-discrimination 4

1.2.2 Council of Europe instruments 5

1.2.3 Non-binding instruments 6

1.2.3.1 The UN Declaration on the Rights of Persons Belonging to National or Ethnic, Religious and Linguistic Minorities 6

1.2.3.2 The Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe 7

1.3 Methodology 8

2 A background to the establishment of human rights in the law and policies of the European Union 11

2.1 Introduction 11

2.2 The EU's institutional framework 12

2.2.1 The Treaties of Rome and Paris 12

2.2.2 Basic overview of the institutional framework 13

2.2.2.1 The Council of the European Union 13

2.2.2.2 The European Council 13

2.2.2.3 The European Commission 14

2.2.2.4 The European Parliament (EP) 14

2.2.2.5 The European Court of Justice (ECJ) 15

2.2.3 Fundamental human rights under the TEC 16

2.3 The Single European Act 17

2.4 The Treaty of Maastricht 18
2.4.1 Human rights under the first pillar, external relations 20
   2.4.1.1 The European Instrument for Democracy and Human Rights (EIDHR) 24
2.4.2 Human rights under the second pillar, CFSP 26
2.4.3 Human rights under the third pillar, JHA 27
2.5 The Treaty of Amsterdam 28
   2.5.1 The principles of Articles 6 and 7 ToA 29
   2.5.2 Discrimination 30
   2.5.3 The European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia (EUMC) 32
   2.5.4 Police and judicial cooperation – an area of freedom, security and justice 33
   2.5.5 The CFSP under the ToA 34
   2.5.6 Justiciability of CFSP 36
2.6 The Treaty of Nice 37
   2.6.1 The Charter of Fundamental Rights under the Treaty of Nice 37
   2.6.2 The EU Network of Independent Experts on Fundamental Rights 42
   2.6.3 Article 7 under the Treaty of Nice 43
   2.6.4 Further developments in CFSP under the Treaty of Nice 43
   2.6.5 The High Representative’s Personal Representative for Human Rights 44
   2.6.6 Enhanced cooperation 45
   2.6.7 Human rights impact assessment 45
2.7 The Constitutional Convention and Draft Constitution 46
2.8 The Treaty of Lisbon 47
   2.8.1 The status of the EU Charter on Fundamental Human Rights and the relationships with the ECJ and the ECtHR/ECHR 48
   2.8.2 Article 6(1) Lisbon Treaty and the interpretation of the EU Charter on Fundamental Rights 49
   2.8.3 The ECJ–ECtHR relationship under the Treaty of Lisbon and EU accession to the ECHR 50
      2.8.3.1 The ECJ’s human rights jurisdiction in the past 51
      2.8.3.2 Discrepancy with the ECtHR’s jurisdiction 56
      2.8.3.3 How the ECtHR dealt with cases of alleged violation of the ECHR rights by EU law or EU institutions 58
   2.8.4 CFSP and JHA under the Treaty of Lisbon 62
   2.8.5 The FRA 63
2.9 Conclusion 65

3 The Common Foreign and Security Policy as an instrument of human rights policy 67
3.1 Introduction 67
3.2 The progression of CFSP in the EU 68
3.3 Why human rights in CFSP? 69
3.4 The legal basis for human rights under the treaties 72
3.5 The recognition of Eastern European countries and the first appearance of minority rights in CFSP 74
3.6 CFSP and the enlargement process 78
3.6.1 Why enlarge to the East? 78
3.7 CFSP — cooperation with other international institutions 80
3.7.1 Cooperation between the EU and CoE 82
3.7.1.1 Joint programmes 83
3.7.1.2 Cooperation with other specialised bodies of the CoE 83
3.7.1.3 The CoE–FRA relationship 84
3.7.1.4 Coordination of legislative initiatives in the human rights field 85
3.7.2 Cooperation with the OSCE 85
3.7.2.1 Institutionalisation of EU–OSCE cooperation 88
3.7.2.2 Cooperation with ODIHR and the HCNM 89
3.8 Conclusion 90

4 The EU and the protection of minority rights in Europe 91
4.1 Introduction 91
4.2 The history of minority rights in Europe 93
4.2.1 Security aspects with regard to minorities 95
4.3 What are minorities? A variety of definitions 96
4.3.1 What type of rights are protected? Collective rights or individual rights? 102
4.3.1.1 CERD 105
4.3.2 What are specific minority rights? 106
4.4 Minority policy in the EU 115
4.4.1 Enlargement policy with regard to CEECs 116
4.4.1.1 Criticism of the EU’s policy with regard to CEECs 120
4.4.2 EP initiatives 122
4.4.3 Minority protection under the TEU and TEC/TFEU provisions 125
4.4.3.1 Article 6 TEU 125
4.4.3.2 Article 13 TEC/19 TFEU 125
4.4.3.3 Article 151 TEC (167 TFEU) 128
4.4.3.4 The Treaty of Lisbon and Articles 21 and 22 of the EU Charter 130
4.4.3.5 The jurisdiction of the ECJ with regard to minorities 132
4.4.3.6 Protection by the Fundamental Rights Agency (FRA) 134
4.4.4 Miscellaneous 136
4.5 Protection through the ECHR and ECtHR 138
4.6 The European Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (FCNM) of 1995 144
4.7 The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages 148
4.8 Protection under the ICCPR 149
4.8.1 The UN Declaration on the Rights of Persons Belonging to National or Ethnic, Religious and Linguistic Minorities 153
4.8.2 CERD 156
4.9 Protection under the CSCE/OSCE 157
4.9.1 The role of the main political bodies 160
4.9.2 The High Commissioner on National Minorities 160
4.9.3 The Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights 164
4.10 Conclusion 164

5 Minority rights in the Member States 167
5.1 Introduction 167
5.2 Estonia 169
5.2.1 Background 169
5.2.2 Constitutional and statutory provisions 170
5.2.2.1 Estonian citizenship law 170
5.2.2.2 The Law on Aliens 172
5.2.3 Institutions for the protection of minorities 173
5.2.4 Education 174
5.2.5 Language rights 175
5.2.6 Culture and media 176
5.2.7 Religion 177
5.2.8 Participation in public affairs 177
5.2.9 The situation of the Roma 178
5.2.10 Conclusion 179
5.3 Germany 179
5.3.1 Background 179
5.3.2 Constitutional and statutory provisions 180
5.3.2.1 Basic Law and federal laws 181
5.3.2.2 Statutory provisions of the Länder 181
5.3.3 Institutions for the protection of minorities 182
5.3.3.1 Federal institutions 182
5.3.3.2 Institutions run by the Länder and the minority groups 182
5.3.4 Education 183
5.3.5 Language rights 184
5.3.5.1 Danish 185
5.3.5.2 Sorbian 185
5.3.5.3 Frisian 186
5.3.5.4 Romani 186
5.3.6 Culture and media 187
5.3.6.1 Culture 187
5.3.6.2 Media 187
5.3.6.2.1 Media supervisory boards 187
5.3.6.3 Minority newspapers, radio and television 188
5.3.7 Religion 188
5.3.8 Participation in public affairs 189
5.3.9 The situation of the Roma 190
5.3.10 Conclusion 191
5.4 Lithuania 192
5.4.1 Background 192
5.4.2 Constitutional and statutory provisions 192
5.4.3 Institutions for the protection of minorities 193
5.4.4 Education 194
5.4.5 Language rights 195
5.4.6 Culture and media 195
5.4.7 Religion 196
5.4.8 Participation in public affairs 197
5.4.9 The situation of the Roma 197
5.4.10 Conclusion 198
5.5 Slovakia 199
5.5.1 Background 199
5.5.2 Constitutional and statutory provisions 200
5.5.3 Institutions for the protection of minorities 201
5.5.4 Education 202
5.5.5 Language rights 204
5.5.6 Culture and media 204
5.5.7 Religion 205
5.5.8 Participation in public affairs 206
5.5.9 The situation of the Roma 207
5.5.10 Conclusion 208
5.6 Slovenia 208
5.6.1 Background 208
5.6.2 Constitutional and statutory provisions 209
5.6.2.1 Citizenship law 210
5.6.3 Institutions for the protection of minorities 211
5.6.4 Education 212
5.6.5 Language rights 213
5.6.6 Culture and the media 214
5.6.7 Religion 214
5.6.8 Participation in public affairs 214
5.6.9 The situation of the Roma 215