The Law of Treaties Beyond the Vienna Convention

Edited by
ENZO CANNIZZARO

Contributors:

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of Abbreviations</th>
<th>xvii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of Contributors</td>
<td>xix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of cases</td>
<td>xxi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### I. CONCLUSION OF TREATIES

1. Are Agreements between States and Non-State Entities Rooted in the International Legal Order?  
   *Olivier Corten and Pierre Klein*
   - 1. The Text of the Agreements: Ceasefires as an Application of the International Prohibition on the Use of Force?  
   - 2. The Text of the Agreements: Principles of Governance as International Legal Obligations?  
   - 3. The Implementation of Peace Agreements: Are They Perceived as International Legal Instruments?  
   - 4. Conclusion
   
2. Article 18 of the 1969 Vienna Convention: A Vague and Ineffective Obligation or a Useful Means for Strengthening Legal Cooperation?  
   *Paolo Palchetti*
   - 1. Introduction
   - 2. An Overly Vague Obligation?
   - 3. An Ineffective Obligation?
   - 4. The Use of Article 18 in Cases before Domestic Judges
   - 5. Conclusions

3. Reservations to Treaties: An Objection to a Reservation is Definitely not an Acceptance  
   *Alain Pellet and Daniel Müller*
   - 1. Acceptance, Objection, and the Entry into Force of the Treaty
   - 2. Acceptance, Objection, and the Relations between the Reserving and the Objecting States

4. Legal Consequences of an Impermissible Reservation to a Human Rights Treaty: Where Do We Stand?  
   *Bruno Simma and Gleider I. Hernández*
   - 1. Introduction
## Contents

Mahnoush H. Arsanjani and W. Michael Reisman  
86

4. The Advantages of a Presumption of Severability  
Mahnoush H. Arsanjani and W. Michael Reisman  
94

5. Provisional Application of Treaties in International Law: The Energy Charter Treaty Awards  
Mahnoush H. Arsanjani and W. Michael Reisman  
106

6. Evolutionary Interpretation of Treaties: Between Memory and Prophecy  
Pierre-Marie Dupuy  
119

7. Evolutionary Interpretation of Treaties: Between Memory and Prophecy  
Pierre-Marie Dupuy  
123

8. Subsequent Practice as a Means of Interpretation in the Jurisprudence of the WTO Appellate Body  
Georg Nolte  
138

9. Supplementary Means of Interpretation  
Luigi Sbolci  
153

II. INTERPRETATION OF TREATIES

6. The Rules on Interpretation: Misgivings, Misunderstandings, Miscarriage? The ‘Crucible’ Intended by the International Law Commission  
Mark E. Villiger  
107

1. Introduction  
Mark E. Villiger  
107

2. Misgivings on Rules on Interpretation  
Mark E. Villiger  
108

3. The Travaux Préparatoires of Articles 31 and 32  
Mark E. Villiger  
109

4. The Means of Interpretation in Articles 31 and 32—An Overview  
Mark E. Villiger  
110

5. The ‘Crucible’—How Are Articles 31 and 32 Intended to Be Applied?  
Mark E. Villiger  
111

6. Misunderstandings—Articles 31 and 32 in Practice and Their Alleged Textual Nature  
Mark E. Villiger  
112

7. Miscarriage? Articles 31 and 32 Qua Customary International Law and Qua Contractual Obligation  
Mark E. Villiger  
113

8. Conclusion  
Mark E. Villiger  
114

7. Evolutionary Interpretation of Treaties: Between Memory and Prophecy  
Pierre-Marie Dupuy  
126

1. Evolutionary Interpretation Supported by Memory  
Pierre-Marie Dupuy  
127

2. Evolutionary Interpretation towards Prophecy  
Pierre-Marie Dupuy  
132

8. Subsequent Practice as a Means of Interpretation in the Jurisprudence of the WTO Appellate Body  
Georg Nolte  
144

9. Supplementary Means of Interpretation  
Luigi Sbolci  
155

1. Introduction  
Luigi Sbolci  
155

2. The General Rule of Interpretation and Supplementary Means  
Luigi Sbolci  
156

3. Conditions of Admissibility of Supplementary Means of Interpretation  
Luigi Sbolci  
159
## Contents

4. The Preparatory Works of a Treaty 151  
5. The Circumstances Surrounding the Conclusion of a Treaty 156  
6. Other Supplementary Means of Interpretation 158  
7. Conclusion 162  

10. Treaty Interpretation by the WTO Appellate Body: The Conundrum of Article 17(6) of the WTO Antidumping Agreement 164  
   Donald McRae  
   1. Introduction 164  
   2. The Article 17(6)(ii) Problem 165  
   3. The Background to Article 17(6)(ii) 167  
   4. The Reaction to Article 17(6) 168  
   5. Article 17.6 and the WTO Appellate Body 169  
   6. The Failure of the Appellate Body's Interpretative Methodology 176  
   7. A Suggested Approach for the Interpretation of Article 17(6)(ii) 180  
   8. Conclusion 182  

III. OBSERVANCE AND APPLICATION OF TREATIES  

11. Consistency among Treaty Obligations 187  
   Benedetto Conforti  
   1. Article 30 of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties 187  
   2. Article 103 of the UN Charter. Apart from the Charter, Are There Treaties which Prevail over Other Treaties? 189  
   3. Treaties Clauses of Compatibility or Subordination 190  

   Jan Klabbers  

13. International Organizations as Third Parties under the Law of International Treaties 206  
   Christian Tomuschat  
   1. Introduction 206  
   2. The 1986 Vienna Convention 208  
   3. Different Axiomatic Premises 210  
   4. The Practice 212  
   5. Assessment 217  
   6. Concluding Observations 223
### Contents

**14. Treaties Establishing Objective Regimes**  
*Francesco Salerno*

1. Introduction 225
2. The Effects of Treaties on Third States under the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties 232
3. The Relevance of Consent in the Conclusion of Treaties Establishing Objective Regimes 236
4. The Significance of Objective Regimes for the International Legal Order 240

**15. The Law of Treaties and the UN Security Council: Some Reflections**  
*Michael Wood*

1. Beyond the Vienna Convention 245
2. ‘Demonization’ of the Council 247
3. Obligations Set Forth in Treaties 248
5. Conclusion 254

**16. The European Courts and the Law of Treaties: The Continuing Story**  
*Pieter-Jan Kuijper*

1. Introduction 256
2. The Trends in the Case Law 258
3. Some Conclusions 276

**17. Some Remarks on the Continuity of Human Rights and International Humanitarian Law Treaties**  
*Fausto Pocar*


### IV. INVALIDITY AND TERMINATION OF TREATIES

**18. Invalidity of Treaties: Anything New in/under the Vienna Conventions?**  
*Joe Verhoeven*

1. Grounds of Invalidity 300
2. Procedure 308
3. Effects 315

**19. Coercion as a Ground Affecting the Validity of Peace Treaties**  
*Serena Forlati*

1. The Rule on Coercion Established by Article 52 of the Vienna Convention 320
2. Practice after 1969 322
3. The Case of the Armed Activities in the Territory of the Congo 325
4. The Role of the Security Council 327
5. Possibility for the Coerced State to Waive its Claim 330
6. Article 52 and the Protection of Collective Interests 330

20. Absolute Invalidity of Treaties and Their Non-Recognition by Third States 333
   Alessandra Gianelli
   2. Possible Approaches Concerning the Position of Third States with Regard to Treaties Absolutely Invalid 336
   3. Non-Recognition and Its Meanings 338
   4. The Early Practice Concerning Non-Recognition of Treaties and Situations 340
   5. The Later Practice 343
   6. Towards an Obligation for Third States not to Recognize a Treaty as Absolutely Invalid 347

21. Desuetude and Obsolescence of Treaties 350
   Marcelo G. Kohen
   1. The Exclusion of Desuetude and Obsolescence from the Vienna Conventions 350
   2. The Notion of Desuetude 352
   3. Is Desuetude a Ground for the Termination of Treaties? 353
   4. The Distinction between Desuetude and Obsolescence of Treaties 357
   5. Conclusion 359

22. Invalidity and Termination of Treaties and Rules of Procedure 360
   Annalisa Ciampi
   1. The Rules of the Vienna Convention 360
   2. National Courts and the Ascertainment of Invalidity or Termination of Treaties 362
   3. The Nature of the Problem at the International Level 365
   4. The Solutions at the National Level 369
   5. Treaties Conflicting with Jus Cogens or Concluded under Threat of Use of Force 372
   6. Concluding Remarks 376
## V. JUS COGENS BEYOND THE VIENNA CONVENTION

23. The Metamorphosis of Jus Cogens: From an Institution of Treaty Law to the Bedrock of the International Legal Order? 381
   Karl Zemanek
   1. A Doctrine Becomes Law 381
   2. Identifying the Norms of Jus Cogens 384
   3. Widening the Scope of Application 391
   4. ‘Constitutionalizing’ International Law? 398
   5. Dissidents 405
   6. Conclusions 409

24. The Distinction between Jus Cogens and Obligations Erga Omnes 411
   Paolo Picone

   Enzo Cannizzaro
   1. Introductory Remarks: Jus Cogens across the Boundaries between the Law of Treaties and the Law of State Responsibility 425
   2. Conceptualizing the Notion of Conflict under Articles 53 and 64: The Classical Forms of Conflict 427
   3. Conflict by Divergence 429
   4. The Ambiguity of the Notion: Divergence and Convergence 432
   5. The Farthest End of the Spectrum: Occasional Collision 434
   6. Jus Cogens and Rules on Sovereign Immunity 437
   7. Concluding Remarks 440

Index 443