Regulating Cartels in Europe

Second edition

CHRISTOPHER HARDING

and

JULIAN JOSHUA

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
CONTENTS

Tables of Cases xv
Tables of Treaties, Legislation, and Notices xxi
Glossary of Key Terms xxiii
Chronology xxvii

Introduction: Talking About Cartels—The Main Elements of Analysis and Discussion 1

1. Epistemology: The Control of Cartels as a Subject 1
2. Political Economy: The Phenomenon and Concept of the Anti-Competitive Cartel 2
3. Legal Control: Competition Law as a Model of Regulation 3
4. Drama: Cartel Control—The Main Actors 4
5. History: A Twentieth Century Overview of European Cartel Control 5
6. International Relations: The Global Dimension 6
7. Pathology: Antitrust Delinquency as the Target of Legal Action 7

I. Business Cartels: Sleeping with the Enemy 9

2. Defining Cartel Arrangements 11
3. The Cooperative Instinct 16
4. The Macro-Economic Context: Typical Markets? 21
5. The Micro-Economic Context: The Quest for Supra-Competitive Profit 29
6. Cartel Dynamics: The Cartel as a Private Treaty Regime 32
7. Mapping the Discussion 38

II. Models of Legal Control: North America and Europe 39

1. Atlantic Crossing: The Usual Suspects, but Differing Perceptions and Models of Legal Control 39
2. Surveying Perceptions of the Subject: The Debate on Cartels 41
4. The European Experience: A Culture of Toleration 52
5. The Quest for Mens Rea: Differing Perceptions of Antitrust Delinquency 56
6. The Dilemma for European Cartel Regulation: Which Model? 62
Appendix 63

III. Cartels in Europe, 1870–1945: Das Kartellproblem 65
1. The Centrality of the German Experience: The ‘Land of Cartels’ 65
2. Cartels in Economic Longitude: Industrialization and Economic Downturn 67
3. Wilhelmine Cartels as Vehicles for Order and Stability 69
4. The Arguments against Cartels and the Need for Regulation: Das Kartellproblem 73
5. The Wider European Picture: Respectable and Necessary or Suspect and Delinquent Organizations? 77
6. The Mid-Century Watershed 84

IV. Cartels in Europe, 1945–70: From Registrable Agreement to Concerted Practice 86
1. Post-War Debates: Back to the Drawing Board 86
2. The Political Perspective: The Cartel as a Tainted Organization 87
3. Cartels and International Trade: Early Attempts at International Regulation 90
4. The Emergence of National Regulation of Cartels in Europe 98
5. The National Position(s): Stocktaking in the Mid-1960s 102
6. The Common Market Context 110
7. The European Cement Market: The Hardening of Cartel Control 115

V. A Narrative of Cartel Regulation in Europe, 1970 to the Present Time 119
1. Reading a History of Regulation and Enforcement: A 40 Years’ War 119
### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. The Early Years of Litigation</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Lull in Litigation: 1975–85</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. European Cartel Litigation: A New Legal Industry</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Turn of the Century: Recovering the Initiative in Enforcement</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Into the Twenty-First Century: Changing Modalities of Enforcement</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>VI. Proof of Cartel Delinquency: Fashioning the European Cartel Offence</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. ‘Delinquency Inflation’ and the Emergence of the Problem of Antitrust Evidence</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Economic Evidence: The Significance of Market Context</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Testing Oligopoly Argument under European Law</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Forging the Cartel Offence: Marshalling the Evidence and Framing the Charge</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Defining the Scope of the Cartel Offence: The Limits of the Single Continuous Infringement</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Collecting Persuasive Proof of Cartel Participation</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>VII. The Judicial Review of Cartel Control: Testing the Evidence and Due Process</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Role of the European Courts</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Testing the Evidence: The Court of First Instance Rolls Up its Sleeves</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The Nature of the Commission’s Procedure</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Investigations and the Collection of Evidence</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Effective Rights of Defence and ‘Access to the File’</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. The Balance of Legal Protection</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
VIII. Negotiating Guilt: Leniency and Breaking the Code of Silence 228
   1. The Psychology of Business Truce: ‘Your Cheating Heart’ 228
   2. Leniency: The American Model—Designing the Irresistible Offer 232
   3. The Political Economy of Leniency: A Transformed Antitrust Landscape 236
   4. Leniency: The EC Model—A ‘Prisoner’s Dilemma’ Playground 241
   6. The Moral Economy of Leniency: Justice, Confession, Incrimination, Guilt, and Betrayal—‘How Do You Sleep?’ 249

IX. The Pathology of Cartels: Addressing Issues of Agency and Responsibility 256
   1. Understanding the Subject of Legal Control 256
   2. The Problem of Agency: Cartels and Cartelists 258
   3. Motivation: The Aetiology of Cartel Activity 266
   4. Cartel Delinquency: So Bad as to be Criminal? 271
   5. The Objectives of Legal Control 277
   6. Constructing a Model of Legal Control 285

X. Sanctions: A Complex European and International Grid 286
   1. Sanctions: A Typology and Geography 286
   2. The Distribution of Sanctions: Corporate and/or Individual Subjects 290
   4. Leniency as a Motor of Penal Expansion 297
   5. The Costs of Penal Expansion 298
   6. The Hidden Flaw in Leniency: Iatrogenicity and Long-Haul Cases 302
   7. Sanctions: The Way Forward 305

XI. Corporate and Individual Sanctions 306
   1. The Scheme of Sanctions 306
   2. Decisions and Orders 307
3. Penalty Discounts and the Saving of Resources 313
4. Financial Penalties: The EU Model 320
5. Criminalization and Imprisonment 329
6. Non-Custodial Criminal Law and Other Measures 354
7. 'Private' Claims for Compensation: The Civil Liability Route 359
8. Sanctions in Total and Across the Board: The Panoply Argument 364

XII. The Shape of Things to Come: Cartel Law in the Twenty-First Century 367
1. Conversion, Convergence, or Global Mosaic? 367
2. Retrospective: A Parallax View? 368
3. The Character of Contemporary European Cartel Law 374
5. A Bright Future? The Experts' Reports 388

Bibliography 392
Index 405