

Contents

1. THE PROBLEM	1
1.1 Sketches of Motivating Examples	1
1.1.1 <i>Electrical Power versus Air Quality</i>	1
1.1.2 <i>Location of an Airport</i>	2
1.1.3 <i>Treatment of Heroin Addiction</i>	3
1.1.4 <i>Medical Diagnostics and Treatment</i>	4
1.1.5 <i>Business Problems</i>	4
1.2 Paradigm of Decision Analysis	5
1.3 Comments About the Paradigm	7
1.3.1 <i>Unitary versus Group Decision Making</i>	8
1.3.2 <i>Personal Conviction, Advocacy, and Reconciliation</i>	9
1.3.3 <i>Prealysis and the Iterative Nature of an Analysis</i>	10
1.3.4 <i>Subjective Values and Formal Analyses</i>	12
1.3.5 <i>Strategic versus Repetitive Decisions</i>	13
1.3.6 <i>Implementation, Postanalysis, and Other Considerations</i>	13
1.4 Complex Value Problems	14
1.4.1 <i>Simple versus Complex Value Problems</i>	14
1.4.2 <i>Is Utility Analysis Necessary?</i>	16
1.4.3 <i>The Use of Hypothetical Questions In Assessments</i>	18
1.5 Classes of Examples and Methodological Nightmares	19
1.5.1 <i>Private Decisions or Individual Cost-Benefit Analyses</i>	19
1.5.2 <i>The Case of the Altruistic Dictator—A Social Welfare Problem</i>	20
1.5.3 <i>Cost-Effectiveness and Cost-Benefit Analyses</i>	20
1.5.4 <i>Temporal Considerations: Present versus Future</i>	22

1.5.5	<i>The Value of a Life</i>	25
1.5.6	<i>Group Decisions</i>	26
1.6	<i>Organization of Remaining Chapters</i>	26

2. THE STRUCTURING OF OBJECTIVES 31

2.1	Objectives and Attributes	32
2.1.1	<i>Some Illustrations</i>	32
2.1.2	<i>Terminology: Objectives, Attributes, and Goals</i>	33
2.2	Generation of Objectives and Attributes	34
2.2.1	<i>Some Techniques for Generating Objectives</i>	34
2.2.2	<i>Illustrations</i>	35
2.2.3	<i>Specification of Attributes</i>	38
2.2.4	<i>Subjective Attribute Scales</i>	40
2.3	Hierarchical Nature of Objectives	41
2.3.1	<i>Constructing the Hierarchy</i>	41
2.3.2	<i>How Far to Formalize?</i>	43
2.3.3	<i>Qualitative Proliferation of the Objectives Hierarchy</i>	44
2.3.4	<i>Subjective versus Objective Measures Revisited</i>	45
2.3.5	<i>Who is the Decision Maker? The Need to Convince Others. Reconciliation of Viewpoints</i>	46
2.3.6	<i>Nonuniqueness of the Objectives Hierarchy</i>	47
2.3.7	<i>An Illustrative Example: Choice of a Transportation System</i>	48
2.4	Sets of Objectives and Attributes	49
2.4.1	<i>Desirable Properties of a Set of Attributes</i>	50
2.4.2	<i>Nonuniqueness of a Set of Attributes</i>	53
2.4.3	<i>An Illustrative Example: Medical Treatment</i>	53
2.5	Proxy Attributes and Direct Preference Measurements	55
2.5.1	<i>What Are Proxy Attributes?</i>	55
2.5.2	<i>Example: Emergency Ambulance Service</i>	57
2.5.3	<i>The Mind as an Informal Synthesizer</i>	58
2.5.4	<i>Common Proxy Attributes</i>	61
2.5.5	<i>Direct Preference Measurements</i>	61
2.5.6	<i>Some Comments on Proxy Attributes and Direct Preference Measurements</i>	63
2.6	Summary and Perspective on the Practical Aspects of Specifying Objectives and Attributes	64

3. TRADEOFFS UNDER CERTAINTY**66**

3.1	The Multiattribute Value Problem	66
3.1.1	<i>Statement of the Problem</i>	67
3.1.2	<i>Organization and Perspective of the Chapter</i>	68
3.2	Choice Procedures That Do Not Formalize Preference Structures	69
3.2.1	<i>Dominance</i>	69
3.2.2	<i>The Efficient Frontier</i>	70
3.2.3	<i>Exploring the Efficient Frontier: Use of Artificial Constraints</i>	72
3.2.4	<i>Exploring the Efficient Frontier: Use of Variable, Linear-Weighted Averages</i>	74
3.3	Structuring of Preferences and Value Functions	77
3.3.1	<i>Lexicographical Ordering</i>	77
3.3.2	<i>Indifference Curves</i>	79
3.3.3	<i>Value Functions</i>	80
3.3.4	<i>Indifference Curves and Value Functions</i>	81
3.4	Preference Structures and Value Functions for Two Attributes	82
3.4.1	<i>The Marginal Rate of Substitution</i>	82
3.4.2	<i>The General Case</i>	83
3.4.3	<i>Constant Substitution: The Case of Linear Indifference Curves</i>	85
3.4.4	<i>Constant Substitution Rates With a Transformed Variable</i>	86
3.4.5	<i>The Corresponding Tradeoffs Condition: An Additive Value Function</i>	90
3.4.6	<i>Conjoint Scaling: The Lock-Step Procedure</i>	91
3.4.7	<i>An Alternative Conjoint Scaling Procedure: The Midvalue Splitting Technique</i>	94
3.4.8	<i>A Hypothetical Illustrated Assessment</i>	96
3.5	The Case of Three Attributes	100
3.5.1	<i>Conditional Preferences</i>	100
3.5.2	<i>Reduction of Dimensionality</i>	102
3.5.3	<i>Mutual Preferential Independence and the Existence of an Additive Value Function</i>	104
3.5.4	<i>Weakening the Additivity Assumptions</i>	107
3.6	The Case of More Than Three Attributes	108
3.6.1	<i>Preferential Independence</i>	109

3.6.2	<i>Mutual Preferential Independence and the Existence of an Additive Value Function</i>	111
3.6.3	<i>Weakening the Additivity Assumptions</i>	112
3.6.4	<i>Selecting Preferentially Independent Sets of Attributes</i>	114
3.6.5	<i>Value Functions with Partial Additivity</i>	116
3.6.6	<i>Using the Additive Value Function</i>	116
3.7	<i>Assessment of an Additive Value Function: An Abstract Hypothetical Example</i>	117
3.7.1	<i>Legitimacy of the Additive Value Function</i>	118
3.7.2	<i>Assessment of Component Value Functions</i>	120
3.7.3	<i>Assessment of Scaling Constants</i>	121
3.7.4	<i>Additional Comments on the λ Function</i>	123
3.8	<i>Willingness to Pay</i>	125
3.8.1	<i>Pricing Out</i>	125
3.8.2	<i>Dominance and Extended Dominance</i>	128
3.9	<i>Brief Summary and Guide to Some Relevant Literature</i>	129

4. UNIDIMENSIONAL UTILITY THEORY 131

4.1	<i>The Motivation for Utility Theory</i>	131
4.1.1	<i>Basic Fundamentals of Utility Theory</i>	132
4.1.2	<i>Alternative Approaches to the Risky Choice Problem</i>	134
4.1.3	<i>Relevance of Unidimensional Utility Theory to Multi-attribute Problems</i>	137
4.1.4	<i>Examples of Unidimensional Decision Problems</i>	138
4.1.5	<i>Outline of This Chapter</i>	139
4.2	<i>Direct Assessment of Utilities for Consequences</i>	140
4.3	<i>Unidimensional Utility Functions</i>	141
4.3.1	<i>Monotonicity</i>	141
4.3.2	<i>The Certainty Equivalent and Strategic Equivalence</i>	142
4.4	<i>Risk Aversion</i>	148
4.4.1	<i>A Definition of Risk Aversion</i>	149
4.4.2	<i>Restricting the Form of the Utility Function</i>	153
4.4.3	<i>The Risk-Prone Case</i>	157
4.5	<i>A Measure of Risk Aversion</i>	159
4.5.1	<i>Interpreting the Risk Aversion Function</i>	161
4.6	<i>Constant, Decreasing, and Increasing Risk Aversion</i>	165
4.6.1	<i>Decreasing Risk Proneness</i>	173

4.7	Proportional Risk Aversion	174
4.7.1	<i>Investments Independent of Asset Position</i>	175
4.7.2	<i>Specifying the Parameter in Utility Functions Exhibiting Constant Proportional Risk Aversion</i>	178
4.8	Monotonically Decreasing and Nonmonotonic Utility Functions	179
4.8.1	<i>Risk Aversion</i>	180
4.8.2	<i>A Measure of Risk Aversion</i>	183
4.8.3	<i>Increasing, Constant, and Decreasing Risk Aversion</i>	185
4.8.4	<i>Nonmonotonic Utility Functions</i>	187
4.9	A Procedure for Assessing Utility Functions	188
4.9.1	<i>Preparing for Assessment</i>	189
4.9.2	<i>Identifying the Relevant Qualitative Characteristics</i>	191
4.9.3	<i>Specifying Quantitative Restrictions</i>	193
4.9.4	<i>Choosing a Utility Function</i>	196
4.9.5	<i>Checking for Consistency</i>	198
4.9.6	<i>Using the Utility Function</i>	200
4.10	Illustrations of the Assessment of Unidimensional Utility Functions	203
4.10.1	<i>Preferences of Oil Wildcatters</i>	204
4.10.2	<i>Preferences of Business Executives</i>	206
4.10.3	<i>Computer Programs to Assess Preferences for Money</i>	209
4.10.4	<i>Preferences in a Hospital Blood Bank</i>	210
4.10.5	<i>Summary</i>	212
4.11	Explicating a Single Attribute by Means of Multiple Attributes	212
4.12	Conditional Unidimensional Utility Theory	214
4.12.1	<i>State-Dependent Preferences</i>	214
4.12.2	<i>Conditional Assessments</i>	216
4.12.3	<i>Conditional Certainty Equivalents</i>	216
4.13	Where We Stand	218

5. MULTIATTRIBUTE PREFERENCES UNDER UNCERTAINTY: THE TWO-ATTRIBUTE CASE

219

5.1	Approaches for Multiattribute Assessment	219
5.1.1	<i>Assessing a Utility Function Over the Attribute "Value"</i>	220
5.1.2	<i>Direct Assessment</i>	222

5.1.3	<i>Qualitative Structuring of Preferences</i>	223
5.1.4	<i>Outline of the Chapter</i>	223
5.2	<i>Utility Independence</i>	224
5.2.1	<i>Definition of Utility Independence</i>	225
5.2.2	<i>Getting a Feeling for Utility Independence</i>	227
5.3	<i>Additive Independence and the Additive Utility Function</i>	229
5.3.1	<i>A Fundamental Result of Additive Utility Theory</i>	231
5.4	<i>The Implications of Mutual Utility Independence</i>	232
5.4.1	<i>The Multilinear Utility Function</i>	233
5.4.2	<i>Use of Isopreference Curves</i>	236
5.4.3	<i>The Multiplicative Representation</i>	238
5.4.4	<i>The Additive Representation</i>	238
5.4.5	<i>Interpretation and Implications of Parameter k</i>	240
5.5	<i>Use of Certainty Equivalents</i>	242
5.6	<i>Utility Functions With One Utility-Independent Attribute</i>	243
5.6.1	<i>Assessments in Terms of Three Conditional Utility Functions</i>	243
5.6.2	<i>Substitution of One Isopreference Curve for One Conditional Utility Function</i>	246
5.6.3	<i>Use of Two Isopreference Curves</i>	249
5.6.4	<i>Special Cases: The Additive and Multilinear Form</i>	250
5.6.5	<i>Use of Certainty Equivalents</i>	252
5.6.6	<i>Utility Independence as an Approximation Technique</i>	253
5.7	<i>What To Do If No Independence Properties Hold</i>	255
5.7.1	<i>A Transformation of Attributes</i>	256
5.7.2	<i>Direct Assessment of $u(y, z)$</i>	257
5.7.3	<i>Employing Utility Independence Over Subsets of $Y \times Z$</i>	257
5.7.4	<i>Weaker Assumptions on the Preference Structure</i>	258
5.8	<i>Assessment Procedure for Multiattribute Utility Functions</i>	261
5.8.1	<i>Introducing the Terminology and Ideas</i>	261
5.8.2	<i>Identifying Relevant Independence Assumptions</i>	263
5.8.3	<i>Assessing Conditional Utility Functions</i>	266
5.8.4	<i>Assessing the Scaling Constants</i>	267
5.8.5	<i>Checking for Consistency and Reiterating</i>	270
5.9	<i>Interpreting the Scaling Constants</i>	271
5.10	<i>The Assessment of a Utility Function in a Hospital Blood Bank</i>	273
5.10.1	<i>The Blood Bank Inventory Control Problem</i>	274
5.10.2	<i>Assessing the Utility Function</i>	275
5.10.3	<i>Conclusions</i>	281

6. MULTIATTRIBUTE PREFERENCES UNDER UNCERTAINTY: MORE THAN TWO ATTRIBUTES	282
6.1 Overview of the Chapter	282
6.1.1 <i>Notation</i>	283
6.1.2 <i>Independence Concepts</i>	284
6.1.3 <i>Organization</i>	285
6.2 Utility Functions With Three Attributes	286
6.3 The Multiplicative Utility Function	288
6.3.1 <i>Weaker Conditions Implying Mutual Utility Independence</i>	292
6.4 The Multilinear Utility Function	293
6.5 The Additive Utility Function	295
6.6 Assessing Multiattribute Utility Functions	297
6.6.1 <i>Verifying Preferential Independence and Utility Independence Conditions</i>	299
6.6.2 <i>Evaluating Scaling Constants</i>	301
6.6.3 <i>Scaling the Conditional Utility Functions</i>	302
6.6.4 <i>Scaling the Additive Utility Function</i>	305
6.6.5 <i>Scaling the Multiplicative Utility Function</i>	307
6.6.6 <i>An Example</i>	307
6.6.7 <i>Consistency Checks</i>	310
6.7 A Fundamental Relationship Between Preferential Independence and Utility Independence	310
6.8 Relationships Among Utility Independence Assumptions	316
6.9 Decomposition of Multiattribute Utility Functions	319
6.10 Additional Representation Theorems	324
6.10.1 <i>Extension of the Multiplicative Form</i>	324
6.10.2 <i>Extension of the Multilinear Form</i>	325
6.10.3 <i>Special Multilinear Forms of the Utility Function</i>	328
6.10.4 <i>The Additive Value Function and Multiplicative Utility Function</i>	330
6.11 Hierarchical Structures and Conditional Preferences	332
6.11.1 <i>Conditional Independence Assumptions</i>	333
6.11.2 <i>Simplifying the Structure of Multiattribute Utility Functions</i>	336
6.11.3 <i>Necessary Conditions for Independence Assumptions</i>	338
6.11.4 <i>Sufficient Conditions for Independence Assumptions</i>	338
6.11.5 <i>An Example Illustrating the Hierarchical Structure</i>	341
6.12 Summary	344

Appendix 6A	GENERALIZATION OF PREFERENTIAL INDEPENDENCE AND UTILITY INDEPENDENCE	345
Appendix 6B	EVALUATING THE SCALING CONSTANT k IN THE MULTIPLICATIVE UTILITY FUNCTION	347
Appendix 6C	AN INTERACTIVE COMPUTER PROGRAM FOR ASSESSING AND USING MULTIATTRIBUTE UTILITY FUNCTIONS	349
7.	ILLUSTRATIVE APPLICATIONS	354
7.1	Air Pollution Control	355
7.1.1	<i>The Air Pollution Control Problem of New York City</i>	356
7.1.2	<i>Identification of Major Objectives</i>	358
7.1.3	<i>Assigning Attributes to Each Objective</i>	359
7.1.4	<i>The Final Set of Objectives and Attributes</i>	361
7.1.5	<i>Decision Analysis of the Sulfur-Dioxide Decision Problem</i>	363
7.1.6	<i>Impact of This Work</i>	364
7.2	Preference Tradeoffs Among Instructional Programs	365
7.2.1	<i>Refining the Problem</i>	366
7.2.2	<i>Relating Program Costs to Output</i>	367
7.2.3	<i>Assessing a Value Function</i>	369
7.3	Fire Department Operations	377
7.3.1	<i>An Overview</i>	377
7.3.2	<i>Use of the Response-Time Utility Function</i>	380
7.3.3	<i>Assessing the Response-Time Utility Function</i>	381
7.3.4	<i>The Response-Time Utility Function</i>	385
7.3.5	<i>Conclusions</i>	388
7.4	Structuring Corporate Preferences for Multiple Objec- tives	390
7.4.1	<i>The 1972 Objectives and Measures of Effectiveness</i>	392
7.4.2	<i>Clarifying the Measures of Effectiveness</i>	395
7.4.3	<i>Checking for Independence Conditions</i>	398
7.4.4	<i>The 1974 Objectives and Measures of Effectiveness</i>	399

7.4.5	<i>Assessing the Utility Function</i>	399
7.4.6	<i>Uses of Woodward-Clyde's Utility Function</i>	406
7.5	<i>Evaluating Computer Systems</i>	408
7.5.1	<i>Preferences of Systems Programmers</i>	409
7.5.2	<i>Uses of the Utility Function</i>	411
7.6	<i>Siting and Licensing of Nuclear Power Facilities</i>	412
7.6.1	<i>Objectives for Nuclear Power Siting</i>	413
7.6.2	<i>A Conceptual Framework for Analyses by the Interested Parties</i>	414
7.6.3	<i>Empirical Assessments</i>	416
7.7	<i>Other Applications</i>	417
7.7.1	<i>The Safety of Landing Aircraft</i>	418
7.7.2	<i>Strategic and Operational Policy Concerning Frozen Blood</i>	418
7.7.3	<i>Sewage Sludge Disposal in the Metropolitan Boston Area</i>	421
7.7.4	<i>Selecting a Job or Profession</i>	422
7.7.5	<i>Transport of Hazardous Substances</i>	426
7.7.6	<i>Treatment for Cleft Lip and Cleft Palate</i>	429
7.7.7	<i>Development of Water Quality Indices</i>	431
7.7.8	<i>Examining Foreign Policy</i>	432
7.7.9	<i>Forest Pest Management</i>	433
7.7.10	<i>Other Applications</i>	434

8. AIRPORT DEVELOPMENT FOR MEXICO CITY: A CASE STUDY

436

8.1	<i>The Problem</i>	436
8.2	<i>Background Information</i>	437
8.2.1	<i>The Physical Environment in Mexico City</i>	438
8.2.2	<i>The Institutional Setting</i>	440
8.2.3	<i>Previous Studies</i>	440
8.3	<i>Evolution of the Analysis</i>	441
8.3.1	<i>An Attempt at Reconciliation through Shared Analysis</i>	442
8.4	<i>The Static Model</i>	442
8.4.1	<i>The Alternatives</i>	443
8.4.2	<i>Objectives and Measures of Effectiveness</i>	443
8.4.3	<i>The Basic Decision Model</i>	444

8.5	Specifying the Possible Impacts of Each Alternative	445
8.5.1	<i>One-Year Assessments</i>	447
8.5.2	<i>Incorporating Time Effects</i>	448
8.5.3	<i>The Thirty-Year Assessments</i>	449
8.5.4	<i>Probabilistic Independence Assumptions</i>	450
8.6	Assessing the Multiattribute Utility Function	451
8.6.1	<i>The Assumptions</i>	452
8.6.2	<i>Verifying the Assumptions</i>	452
8.6.3	<i>Forms of the Utility Function</i>	453
8.6.4	<i>Assessing the u_i's</i>	454
8.6.5	<i>The Capacity Utility Function</i>	457
8.6.6	<i>Assessing the k_i Scaling Factors</i>	458
8.6.7	<i>Assessing Parameter k</i>	459
8.6.8	<i>The Utility Function</i>	459
8.7	The Analysis	459
8.7.1	<i>The Input-Output Display</i>	460
8.7.2	<i>Effective Strategies</i>	461
8.7.3	<i>Use of the Analysis</i>	462
8.8	The Dynamic Analysis	463
8.8.1	<i>Alternatives for 1971</i>	463
8.8.2	<i>Objectives</i>	464
8.8.3	<i>Possible Scenarios</i>	465
8.8.4	<i>First Evaluation of Nominal Alternatives</i>	466
8.8.5	<i>Final Analysis of Dynamic Options</i>	469
8.9	Impact of the Results	470
8.9.1	<i>The Ensuing Political Process</i>	471
9.	PREFERENCES OVER TIME	473
9.1	Characteristics of the Time Problem	474
9.2	The Certainty Case: Value Functions over Time Streams	476
9.2.1	<i>The Net Present Value</i>	477
9.2.2	<i>Discounting Monetary Amounts at a Constant Rate</i>	479
9.2.3	<i>Preference Orderings for Infinite Streams with a Stationary Assumption</i>	483
9.2.4	<i>Other Situations Leading to Discounting</i>	485
9.3	The Uncertainty Case: Utility Functions Over Time Streams	488
9.3.1	<i>The Two-Period Case</i>	488
9.3.2	<i>The Multiple-Period Case</i>	491
9.3.3	<i>Continuous-Consumption Streams</i>	493

9.4	Relaxing the Independence Assumptions	494
9.5	Uncertain Horizon	497
9.6	State-Dependent Utilities	501
9.6.1	<i>Efficient Backward and Forward State Descriptors</i>	501
9.7	Problems of Application	503
9.7.1	<i>Univariate Assessment and Fairing</i>	503
9.7.2	<i>Multivariate Assessment</i>	506
9.8	Time Resolution of Uncertainty	509
9.8.1	<i>Evolving Utility</i>	509
9.8.2	<i>Anxiety Along the Way</i>	511
9.8.3	<i>Hedging and Anticipating</i>	512
Appendix 9A. DERIVATION OF A UTILITY FUNCTION FOR CONSUMPTION AND LIFETIME		513
10.	AGGREGATION OF INDIVIDUAL PREFERENCES	515
10.1	The Decision Maker as Synthesizer or Amalgamator	516
10.1.1	<i>The Pure Cases</i>	516
10.1.2	<i>Complications</i>	519
10.1.3	<i>The Participatory Group</i>	520
10.1.4	<i>Related Work</i>	521
10.1.5	<i>Orientation</i>	522
10.2	Aggregating Individuals' Preferences Under Certainty	523
10.2.1	<i>Arrow's Impossibility Theorem</i>	523
10.2.2	<i>Additive Group Value Functions</i>	524
10.3	Aggregating Individuals' Preferences Under Uncertainty	527
10.3.1	<i>Additive Group Utility Functions</i>	527
10.3.2	<i>More General Group Utility Functions</i>	528
10.3.3	<i>A Specialization Leading to the Additive Form</i>	531
10.4	Additive Utility and Equity Considerations	532
10.4.1	<i>Prior versus Posterior Equity</i>	532
10.4.2	<i>Pareto Optimality</i>	534
10.4.3	<i>Appraisal of Assumption 7, Universal Agreement</i>	534
10.5	Appraisal of the Independence Assumptions	536
10.5.1	<i>Appraisal of Assumption 5, Utility Independence</i>	536
10.5.2	<i>Appraisal of Assumption 2, Ordinal Positive Association, and Assumption 4, Strategic Equivalence</i>	537
10.5.3	<i>Appraisal of Assumption 1, Preferential Independence</i>	537

10.6	Assessing Group Utility Functions	539
10.6.1	<i>The Supra Decision Maker Model</i>	539
10.6.2	<i>The Participatory Group Decision</i>	540
10.6.3	<i>Hierarchies of Group Decisions and Other Complications</i>	541
10.7	Uses of Multiattribute Utility Analysis for Groups	542
10.7.1	<i>Some Pragmatic Alternatives</i>	543
10.7.2	<i>Advantages of Partial Formalization</i>	544
10.7.3	<i>Generating Creative Alternatives</i>	545
10.7.4	<i>Social Indices and the Quality of Life</i>	546

BIBLIOGRAPHY	549
---------------------	------------

INDEX	561
--------------	------------