

# Contents

*Foreword ix*

*Introduction xiii*

## I. THE PROBLEM AND THE PROFESSION'S RESPONSE

- 1 *Physicians' Conflicts of Interest 1*
  - The Patient-Physician Relationship 1
  - What Are Conflicts of Interest? 8
  - The Changing Context of Medicine 11
- 2 *The Medical Profession's Response: 1890-1992 19*
  - Conflicts of Interest and the AMA and ACS Response:  
1890 to 1950 21
  - The Commercial Transformation: 1950s to 1980 31
  - The Ethics of Markets: 1980 to 1992 40
  - Bioethics 46
  - Conclusion 51

## II. CURRENT PROBLEMS AND INSTITUTIONAL RESPONSES

- 3 *Incentives to Increase Services:*
  - The Range of Existing Practices 55*
    - Financial Arrangements That Create Conflicts of Interest 55
    - The Maze of Financial Incentives 57
    - The Unity of Conflicts of Interest 94
- 4 *The Dangers of Incentives to Increase Services  
and the Ineffectiveness of Current Responses 97*
  - The Dangers of Financial Incentives 98
  - Countering Financial Incentives:
    - Utilization and Peer Review 111
  - The Limitations of Current Law and Policy 115
- 5 *Incentives to Decrease Services In HMOs and Hospitals 135*
  - Withholding Services and Conflicts of Interest 135
  - HMOs and Financial Incentives 138
  - Hospitals and Financial Incentives 148

- 6    *The Dangers of Incentives to Decrease Services  
and the Ineffectiveness of Current Responses*    152**  
       The Dangers of Financial Incentives    152  
       Countering Financial Incentives: Peer Review  
       and Quality Assurance    162  
       The Limitations of Current Law    165

### III. INFERENCES FOR POLICY

- 7    *Fiduciary Law and the Professions: Regulation of Civil Servants,  
Business Professionals, and Lawyers*    179**  
       Fiduciary Principles and the Professions    179  
       Conflicts of Interest of Public Officials    184  
       Conflicts of Interest in Business    192  
       Conflicts of Interest of Lawyers    200  
       Common Intervention Strategies  
       to Hold Fiduciaries Accountable    207  
       Lessons for Physicians    210
- 8    *What Needs to Be Done?*    212**  
       The Limits of Disclosure as a Remedy    213  
       The Limits of Public Intervention    220  
       Policies for Physicians' Conflicts of Interest    223  
       The Job Ahead    234  
       Incentives, Ethics, Law, and Social Policy    244

***Table of Acronyms*    249**

### APPENDICES

- A    *The Concept of Conflict of Interest*    253**  
**B    *Note on Physicians' Divided Loyalties*    256**  
**C    *Bioethics and Medical School Ethics Education*    259**  
**D    *The Sources and Data Used*    264**  
**E    *Excerpts from Medical Codes of Ethics*    268**

***Notes*    271**

***Acknowledgments*    391**

***About the Author*    397**

***Index*    399**

## Foreword

Medical care in America has become dangerously expensive. Consuming more than \$800 billion in 1992 and growing at a compound rate of about 10% per year, medical costs now thwart efforts to reduce the deficit and threaten the viability of our economy. At the present rate of growth more than 16% of our gross domestic product would be devoted to the health sector by the end of this decade—a circumstance that would be disastrous for competing public and private needs.

The American medical care system has also become heavily commercialized. In addition to the thousands of businesses, large and small, that supply medically related products and services, at least a third of all facilities providing medical care are controlled by investor-owned corporations. Even the so-called “not-for-profit” hospitals have caught the entrepreneurial fever, as they compete for their share of the new health care market. What was formerly a community-based social service has become a vast industry which, like other industries, seeks to maximize its revenues and expand its markets. Over nine million people work in this industry, including about 600,000 physicians who play the key role in directing health expenditures. This industry’s revenues are the health care expenses that business, government, and private consumers are forced to bear.

Practicing physicians are at the center of the health care system and they are its controlling element. Although their professional fees and salaries constitute less than 20% of all health care expenditures, their decisions, opinions, and recommendations account for the expenditure of most of the rest. If our health care system now faces a cost-crisis—and there is nearly universal agreement that it does—the proximate cause of that crisis must be sought in the behavior of physicians. The behavior of physicians has many determinants. In practicing their profession, physicians must respond to the clinical problems their patients bring to them, and these problems become increasingly numerous and