

Contents

1	The Concept of “Peer Reviewing”	1
1.1	What Is Peer Reviewing About?	1
1.1.1	The Role and Function of Peer Reviewing	1
1.1.2	The Importance of Peer Reviewing	2
1.2	How Does Peer Reviewing Work?	3
1.2.1	Blind Reviewing	3
1.2.2	Arguments in Favor	4
1.2.3	Arguments Against	5
1.2.4	New Trends	6
1.3	To Conclude	10
2	Characteristics of a Good Reviewer	11
2.1	Some Good Review Principles	11
2.1.1	Be Honest About	11
2.1.2	Be Objective and Fair	15
2.1.3	Respect Confidentiality	17
2.2	Issues to Pay Attention To	17
2.2.1	The Review Object (Paper Under Review)	18
2.2.2	The Review Subject (The Reviewer Himself/Herself)	24
2.3	To Conclude	27
3	Tips and Tricks	29
3.1	Good Reviewers Keep the Following in Mind	29
3.1.1	Do Not Waste Your Time on Sloppy Authors	29
3.1.2	Avoid Repetitions	30
3.1.3	Never Include Details of a Personal Nature	31
3.1.4	Elaborate Your One/Two-Liners	32
3.1.5	Check on Student Reviews	34
3.1.6	Structure Your Review Comments According to the Evaluation Criteria and Make Them Correspond to Your Marks (If Applicable)	35

3.1.7	Always Mention Some Positive Aspects (Strengths) of the Paper as well as Some Weak Points as Suggestions to Improve the Quality of the Paper	36
3.1.8	Include Specific Questions to the Authors	37
3.1.9	Check the List of References	39
3.1.10	Search the Internet Using the Title and/or Abstract	41
3.1.11	Differentiate Your Reviews	42
3.1.12	Give Accurate and Specific Comments	43
3.1.13	Review Independently	44
3.2	Some Miscellaneous Issues	45
3.2.1	How to Review a Submission by (Students of) the Chair or Organizer?	45
3.2.2	What to Summarize?	46
3.2.3	How to Organize Your Review?	47
3.2.4	How to Meta-Review a Paper?	49
3.3	To Conclude	50
4	Conclusion	51
Appendix: Selected Literature and Links		53
	Some Papers on Reviewing in General	53
	Some Guidelines for Reviewers with Practical Suggestions	54
	Papers That Discuss Possible Future Trends in Peer Reviewing	56
	Examples of Bad Practice	57