ISLAM, LAW AND THE STATE IN SOUTHEAST ASIA

Volume I: Indonesia

Tim Lindsey
## CONTENTS

List of Tables and Figures xiii

Terminology xv

Acknowledgements xvii

Series Preface: Islam, Law and the State in Southeast Asia xxii

### Chapter 1. Shari'a and its Discontents: Challenging the State Madhhab in Indonesia

1. The National Madhhab: Local or Imported Law? 6
2. The Myth of Transplants 9
3. Islamisation from Below 15
4. Conclusion: Persistence of the National Madhhab 23

### PART I SOURCES OF ISLAMIC REGULATION

### Chapter 2. Pancasila and the Constitution

1. Pancasila vs Jakarta Charter 36
2. P4: Pancasila under Soeharto 42
3. The Fading of the Pancasila 45
4. Reviving Pancasila? 49

II. Freedom to Believe? 52
1. Regulation of Places of Worship 54
2. Recognition of ‘Beliefs’ 59
3. Conclusion: Recognition without Protection 62
CONTENTS

Waqf in the New Order 178
The Reformasi Period 181
Conclusion: Bureaucratised Piety 184

Chapter 6. The Regulation of Islamic Financial Institutions 188
I. Islamic Banking
   Development of a Regulatory Framework 194
   Šukūk 202
   Three Islamic Banking Contracts 203
II. Islamic Insurance
   Structure of Islamic Insurance Contracts 209
   Regulation of Islamic Insurance 210
   The Syariah Supervisory Board 211
Conclusion: A Dual System of State Control 213

Chapter 7. The Regulation of Islamic Education 217
I. Madrasah, Pesantren and the National Education Laws 218
   Responsibility for Islamic Schools in Indonesia 220
II. Islamic Schools
   Madrasah 224
   Pesantren 228
   Sekolah Islam 234
   Islam in Non-Islamic Schools 235
III. Islamic Tertiary Education 237
   Regulation and Accreditation 238
   Attitude and Approach 240
   Curriculum Reform 242
Conclusion: Educational Reform as Political Strategy 249

PART III
THE ISLAMIC JUDICIARY

Chapter 8. The Religious Courts 255
I. The Religious Courts in the National Judicial System 256
   Perceptions of the Judiciary 258
   Structure and Jurisdiction 261
# II. Administration

## The Religious Courts

- The Religious Courts Law
- The 'One Roof' Reforms
- The Directorate General of Religious Justice
- Resources and Infrastructure
- Staff Levels and Performance

## III. Women and the Poor in the Religious Courts

- Conclusion: An End to Institutional Marginalisation?

### Chapter 9. The Mahkamah Syar’iyah of Aceh

- I. Structure and Operation
  - Impact of the Tsunami
- II. Shari’a Jurisdiction in Aceh
  - Contesting Shari’a Jurisdiction in Aceh
  - Applying Shari’a Jurisdiction in Aceh
- Conclusion: Towards a New Judicial Fiqh in Aceh?

### Chapter 10. Judicial Decision-Making in the Religious Courts

- I. Jurisdiction, Structure and Sources
  - Appeals
  - Structure and Style of Decisions
  - Quality of Reasoning
  - Sources
  - Divorce Law
- II. Case Studies
- Conclusion: A Symbolic Religiosity

# Part IV

## Contesting Shari’

### Chapter 11. Regional Laws: Perda Syariah and Qanun

- I. Perda Syariah
  - The Content of Perda Syariah
  - Reviewing and Invalidating Perda
- II. Aceh's Qanun
  - Legal Status of Qanun
Consultative Council of Ulama  
(Majelis Permusyawaratan Ulama, MPU) 383  
The Qanun Shari'a Regime 386  
Enforcing Shari'a: the Jinayat Controversy 392  

Conclusion: A Dilemma of Democratisation 396

Chapter 12. National Laws: 'Deviant Sects', the Criminal Code and the Regulation of Belief 401  
I. Offences against Religion under the Criminal Code 402  
   Art. 156a: New Order Prosecutions 403  
   Post-Soeharto Criminal Code Prosecutions before April 2005 406  
   Prosecutions of Sects after April 2005 409  
   Ahmadiyah 419  
   The Constitutional Court Blasphemy Decision 428  

II. Amending the Criminal Code 431  
    Contents of the Draft Revised Criminal Code 432  
    Conclusion: Patterns of Persecution 435

I. The Anti-Pornography Bills 446  
   Content of the 2005–06 Bill 451  
   Responses to the 2005–06 Bill 456  
   Revision of the Bill 2006–08 462  

II. The Anti-Pornography Law 464  
   Differences between the Law and the Bill 464  
   Reaction to the Passing of the Law 474  
   The Pornography Law and the Constitutional Court 476  

Volume Conclusion: The Dilemma of the Secular State 481

Acronyms 491

Glossary 495

Appendix: Three Islamic Banking Contracts 511
Table of Legislation 533
Table of Cases 547
Index 549
CONTENTS

List of Tables and Figures xi

Terminology xiii

Acknowledgements xv

Series Preface: Islam, Law and the State in Southeast Asia xvii

Chapter 1. Governing the Muslim Minority in Singapore: Law, Legal Institutions and the Anglo-Malay Madhab 1

PART I

SOURCES OF ISLAMIC REGULATION

Chapter 2. Islamic Law under Colonial Rule: The Ordinances 15

Reception of English Law and its Influence on Islamic Law 16

Administration of Islam under Colonial Rule 22

Conclusion: Patterns for Post-Colonial Development 46

Chapter 3. Islamic Law Post-Independence: The Administration of Muslim Law Act 51

Singapore, Malaya and Malaysia: 1957–1965 52

Singapore as an Independent State: 1965 onwards 53

Accommodation of Islamic Law in a Secular Legal Framework 74

Conclusion: Colonial Continuity 79
### PART II
**Non-Judicial Legal Institutions**

#### Chapter 4. State Islamic Institutions
- Ministry of Community Development, Youth and Sports (MCYS) 86
- Registry of Muslim Marriages (ROMM) 88
- Majlis Ugama Islam Singapore (MUIS) 94
- MUIS and Fatāwā 120
- Conclusion: MUIS – An Involuted Institution? 133

#### Chapter 5. Regulation of Islamic Education
- State Policy, Malay Identity and Religious Education 140
- The Trajectory of Madrasah Development 145
- Other Options for Islamic Education 171
- Conclusion: The Future of Islamic Religious Education 175

### PART III
**The Islamic Judiciary**

#### Chapter 6. The Syariah Court System
- Structure of the Syariah Court 187
- Development of the Syariah Court 191
- Preference for the Secular Courts? A Comparison of the AMLA and the Women's Charter 199
- Enforcement of Decisions 202
- Conclusion: A Court between Two Traditions 205

#### Chapter 7. Judicial Decision-Making in the Syariah Courts
- Sources of Law 208
- Structure and Style of Decisions 213
- Judicial Reasoning 214
- Case Studies 218
- Conclusion: The Worst of Both Worlds? 230
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

**PART IV**

**ALTERNATIVE VISIONS OF SHARI'A AND STATE RESPONSES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 8.</th>
<th>The Legal Framework of Muslim Identity in Singapore</th>
<th>237</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Politics, Ethnicity and Religion in</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Post-Independence Singapore</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Maintenance of Religious Harmony Act</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Internal Security Act and the Sedition Act</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Tudung Debate</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Constructing a 'Singapore Muslim' Identity?</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Codifying Religious Harmony</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusion: Enforcing an Engineered Harmony</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 9.</th>
<th>Malay-Muslim Organisations and Politics</th>
<th>268</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Islamic, Muslim or Malay Political Movements?</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PAP Political Initiatives for the Inclusion of</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Malay Muslims</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Malay-Muslim Non-Governmental Organisations</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusion: The Impossibility of Malay-Muslim</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Political Leadership?</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Acronyms**

291

**Glossary**

294

**Table of Legislation**

299

**Table of Cases**

301

**Index**

303
## CONTENTS

List of Tables and Figures xiii

Terminology xvii

Acknowledgements xix

Series Preface: Islam, Law and the State in Southeast Asia xxiii

### SECTION A

**MALAYSIA**

Chapter 1. Malaysia, Islam and the Anglo-Malay Madhhab 3
- The Anglo-Malay Madhhab 4
- Malay Supremacy and Islamic Revival 7
- Conclusion: Malaysia as Islamic State? 13

### PART I

**SOURCES OF ISLAMIC REGULATION IN MALAYSIA**

Chapter 2. Islamic Law under Colonial Rule 21
- Shari'a before Colonisation 21
- Administration of Islam under Colonial Rule 24
- Reception of English Law and its Influence on Islamic Law 28
- The Codification of Islamic Law 32
- Conclusion: Patterns for Post-Colonial Development 42
# ISLAM, LAW AND THE STATE IN SOUTHEAST ASIA

## Chapter 3. Islamic Law after Independence
- Islam in the Constitution 46
- Early State Enactments: 1950s and 1960s 49
- Legislative Reform in the 1980s 61
- Conclusion: Resisting the Federal Model 68

## PART II
**NON-JUDICIAL LEGAL INSTITUTIONS IN MALAYSIA**

### Chapter 4. State Islamic Institutions
- State-Level Islamic Institutions 78
- Federal Islamic Institutions 90
- Fatâwâ Production 97
- Conclusion: Re-Defining the 'Islamic State'? 108

### Chapter 5. Regulation of Islamic Banking and Financial Institutions
- Regulation of Islamic Banking and Finance 113
- The Regulation of Zakât 131

### Chapter 6. Regulation of Islamic Education
- Islamic Pre-Tertiary Education 151
- Islamic Higher Education 171
- Islamic Think-Tanks 176
- Conclusion: Integrating Islamic Education 178

## PART III
**THE ISLAMIC JUDICIARY IN MALAYSIA**

### Chapter 7. The Syariah Courts
- Early Development of the Syariah Courts 185
- The Modern Syariah Courts 195
- Jurisdictional Division between the Syariah Courts and the Secular Courts 211
- Conclusion: The Continuing Debate 228
PART II
NON-JUDICIAL ISLAMIC LEGAL INSTITUTIONS IN BRUNEI

Chapter 13. State Islamic Institutions
Ministry of Religious Affairs
The Islamic Religious Council
Fatâwâ and the State Mufti
Conclusion: Autocratic Control of Islamic Opinion

Chapter 14. The Regulation of Islamic Education
A History of Islamic Education in Brunei
Post-WWII Development of Islamic Education
Pre-Tertiary Islamic Education
Islamic Higher Education
Conclusion: Educating Malay Muslim Monarchists

PART III
THE ISLAMIC JUDICIARY IN BRUNEI

Chapter 15. The Syariah Courts
Court Reforms under the British Colonial Residency System
Reform of the Court System, 1955 to 1984
Current Structure of the Courts under the Syariah Courts Act of 2000
Case Study: Apostasy

Sources of Law
Structure and Style of Decisions
Case Studies: Family Law
Conclusion: State-Sanctioned Shari‘a

PART IV
EMBEDDING SHARIA: ISLAM, STATE AND POLITICS IN BRUNEI

Chapter 17. Islam and Political Movements
Brunei’s Turning Point in the 1950s–1960s: Democracy or Monarchy?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th>xi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Constitution of 1959</td>
<td>499</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Revolt of 8 December 1962</td>
<td>501</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Further Entrenchment of Power</td>
<td>503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prospects for Political Change</td>
<td>508</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Section B Conclusion: Shari’a, at the Sultan’s Pleasure</strong></td>
<td>509</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronyms</td>
<td>512</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glossary</td>
<td>516</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Legislation</td>
<td>524</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Cases</td>
<td>530</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>533</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>